

Northwest Ohio Quarterly

Volume 27

Issue 1

The President's Page

POWERS OF CONGRESS

It can not be too often emphasized that the government of the United States is one of *enumerated powers*. Such specific powers are primarily found in Section 8 of Article I of the Constitution. In this respect, it differs from the constitutions of the several States, which are not grants of powers to the States, but which apportion and impose restrictions upon the powers which the States inherently possess.

The generation just past has witnessed an expansion of these powers beyond the wildest dreams of the framers of the Constitution. Aided by a depression of unparalleled depth and intensity, the debtor classes swept Franklin D. Roosevelt into the White House in 1932. The New Administration attempted to meet the crisis by "emergency legislation" involving "the right to experiment". These laws met with momentary approval of even industrialists, which may have encouraged the Supreme Court to uphold the Minnesota mortgage moratorium statute, the New York law fixing the price of milk, and the law abrogating contracts calling for payment in gold. By 1935, when apparently business was recovering, the public became skeptical of experimentation and tired of regulation. The Supreme Court declared the National Recovery Act unconstitutional and also nullified the Farm Mortgage Act, the Agricultural Adjustment Act, the Guffey Coal Act and the New York Minimum Wage Law.

In February, 1937, the President recommended the "Court-packing" bill, which was defeated after five and a half months' bitter debate. According to Professor Corwin, a most influential factor which led to this defeat of the bill was the "switch in time which saved nine",—the Court's change of decisions in order to avert the threat to its independence. The great change came in April, when the Court handed down five decisions upholding the National Labor Relations Act, going far beyond previous cases in expanding the scope of the commerce clause of the Constitution. Shortly thereafter, the Court sustained social security legislation. Before the end of May, 1937, the Court, with little change in personnel, and without formal amendment, but merely by re-interpretation of the Constitution, had reversed or modified a considerable proportion of its decisions during the preceding two years. In subsequent terms, as Roose-

The President's Page

velt appointed new justices, the Court demonstrated the truth of Chief Justice Hughes' remark that the Constitution means what the judges say it means. Thus, without a revolution and without formal amendment, the Constitution again proved to be sufficiently flexible to meet the social problems of our day, whether we like the medicine or not.

Lehr Fess

The Director's Page

Let's Have More Meetings

Friends have often said to me, "I'm so sorry that I don't get around to the meetings of the Historical Society. You know how it is—there are so many things to go to." The sad truth of the matter is that there have not been many meetings of our Society. The annual meeting is always confined to business matters. Attendance by proxy is encouraged. We had one way back in 1951 on the occasion of the "launching" of our book *Lake Port*, volume 3 of our Historical Series.

We finally got around to another one on December 16, 1954 at the Toledo Public Library when we "launched" *Industrial Beginnings*. It was not well attended, but it was certainly genuinely enjoyable. Judge Fess presided. Vocalist Harry Oster touched the hearts of everybody with his repertoire of Ohio folk songs. Member Earl Aiken inspired us all with a thumbnail sketch of John Ford, father of the plate glass industry. The director made a few remarks which Judge Fess chose to call "nearly oratory." At any rate, when the meeting broke up everybody was in a mellow mood, and was glad to have come.

And so we are going to reform ourselves. Meetings will be held more frequently. Care will be taken to make them entertaining as well as instructive. Watch for an announcement about our spring meeting.

RANDOLPH C. DOWNES

A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry in the Toledo Milkshed Area

BY GEORGE A. BRANDT, JR.

1. *The Toledo Milkshed*

The Toledo milkshed comprises most of northwestern Ohio and southeastern Michigan. There are located in this region about 2,000 milk producers who sell their product to dairies in the Toledo milk marketing area. Hillsdale, Jackson, Lenawee, Monroe, Washtenaw and Wayne counties make up the Michigan sector of the milkshed, which furnishes about 40 percent of Toledo's milk supply. The remaining 60 percent of the milk comes from the Ohio division of the region which is made up of parts of or all of the following counties: Defiance, Fulton, Hancock, Henry, Huron, Lucas, Ottawa, Putnam, Sandusky, Seneca, Williams, Wood and Wyandot. Lenawee and Monroe counties in Michigan; and Fulton, Sandusky, and Wood counties in Ohio furnish between 75 and 80 percent of the fluid milk that enters Toledo markets.¹ It should be noted that only about 20 percent of the total amount of the milk produced within the milkshed area enters Toledo markets. Other towns and large milk product industries have their own individual milksheds which may cover a part of or all of the same general area that comprises the Toledo milkshed.

There are several large milk-evaporating plants located within this region that use a considerably larger amount of milk in their operation than is utilized in Toledo dairies and milk product industries. Cleveland and Detroit receive fluid milk and cream from within this same general area for use in their own fluid milk operations. Numerous Atlantic coastal cities receive cream from some dairies and producer marketing organizations in the Toledo area. It must be understood that the general area that comprises the Toledo milkshed is not an exclusive domain of Toledo dairy interests or of the Toledo milk marketing area which includes the city of Toledo and the adjoining villages and townships, both in Ohio and Michigan.

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

2. *A Description of the Area Under Survey*

The overall difference in elevation for the whole region is less than 700 feet. In general local relief varies less than fifty feet, except in the morainic areas of Hillsdale, Lenawee and Jackson counties. This morainic area is generally better adapted to dairying activities owing to the limited amount of land that can be placed under cultivation. For this reason that land is better suited for pastoral purposes, which is favorable to dairying interests. South and east of this region the terrain is somewhat flatter, and in this area more land is under cultivation. Dairying in this region is carried on in connection with general farming activities. This area is divided into two general regions; the till plain region and the lacustral or lake plain region.

Except for parts of Hillsdale, Jackson and Wayne counties most of the area is drained by streams that flow into Lake Erie. The streams that flow through this region are generally sluggish in nature owing to the low gradient of both the streams and the general land surface. Rapids may be found in some streams where they cross bedrock. Most of northwestern Ohio and part of Michigan is drained by the Maumee River system which empties its waters into Lake Erie at Toledo. The Maumee is the largest river in the region and drains the major part of the milkshed. The River Raisin, which is about 150 miles long, drains most of the Michigan milkshed area; and enters Lake Erie at Monroe, Michigan. The Ottawa River or Ten Mile Creek drains most of the stateline areas and empties its waters into Maumee Bay at Toledo. The eastern section of the milkshed is drained by the following river systems: the Portage, Sandusky, Huron and Vermilion. Several short creeks drain the low lacustral plain that borders Lake Erie.

The areas immediately adjoining Lake Erie take the form of a low lake plain with swamp-lands characterizing marginal lake areas and drier flat lowlands in the more interior regions. At various intervals throughout the lake plain, there will be found alternating deposits of sand and clay interspersed with sand or clay loam areas.

Most of the present day land forms were created or modified to their present status during the Pleistocene epoch of geologic time. This Pleistocene epoch took place during the preceding million years of the history

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

of the earth. It was during this period that this region was glaciated extensively by a series of glaciers, the last of which was the Wisconsin glacial stage. This glacial period existed between 25,000 and 55,000 years ago.² As the ice melted the glacier retreated leaving various ground and recessional moraines. These moraines are composed of glacial drift; that is material brought in by the glaciers and left here when they melted. These areas are recognized by their general hilly nature and by the numerous glacial erratics or boulders that are found in these areas. The morainic areas are considerably rougher than the lake plain areas although some moraines are found within the lacustral plain region.

The ice, as it melted formed a large glacial lake known as Lake Maumee; the outlet of this lake was to the west through a channel that is now occupied in part by the Wabash River. The northern outlet of this lake at this time was blocked by glacial ice. This lake developed a beach which can be located now by a belt of sand ridges that are present on the land surface of part of the milkshed area. The waters of this lake tended to wash and stratify the glacial deposits to considerable extent forming a lacustral plain. As the ice receded, new outlets to the north were opened that were lower than the Wabash outlet. The level of the lake dropped at various periods forming new beaches; at each stage the lake was known by a different name. The lake gradually receded to its present stage and is known now as Lake Erie. In the present lacustral plain there are a series of sand belts which represent former beaches of the lake as it receded; the Oak-openings, which lies west of Toledo, represents a series of former lake beaches. The newer beaches lie closer to the lake and the older ones extend into northeastern Indiana. Dairying is not generally carried on in the beach ridge areas, but it is carried to some extent in the flanking areas that are near the beach ridges.

The till plains are the ground moraine areas that were not covered by the lakes. These areas may be found in the northwestern and southern sections of the milkshed. In the southern areas, the terrain is generally flat or gently rolling. This was caused by a generally even retreat of the glacier as it receded northward. The areas to the northwest are of a more rolling nature owing to the uneven retreat of the glacial ice. Isolated blocks of ice eventually formed small lakes as they melted. The drainage pattern in these areas is generally poor with frequent lakes and swamps dominating the landforms.

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

Climatic conditions in the Toledo area come under the continental humid classification of climatic types.³ The climate, while being temperate, is characterized by relatively short periods of extreme cold and heat. The climate and weather of the region is controlled in part by the extensive continental land areas that lie to the west and south; and in part of the proximity of Lake Erie. The influences of the continental land areas to the south and west are more important owing to the decided prevalence of southwesterly winds. Land that is in close proximity to the lake generally has a longer growing season than does the more interior areas. This is caused by the moderating effect that large bodies of water have on frost action, especially in the fall and winter seasons.⁴ Defiance, which is about 50 miles from the Lake, has an average growing season of 152 frost free days. Wauseon, in Fulton county, has an average growing season of 145 days. Napoleon, in Henry county, has a growing season of 161 frost free days. Toledo has an average growing season of 179 days. Sandusky, which is located on Sandusky Bay, has an average growing season of 194 days. North Bass Island in Lake Erie, which is one of the most northerly sections of Ohio, has one of the longest growing seasons, 206 days.⁵ The mean annual temperature at Toledo of about 50° F. is about the same for the rest of the milkshed. The average annual rainfall for the Toledo area is less than 33 inches. The more interior regions of the milkshed have a higher annual rainfall, which may average several inches higher.⁶ The climate is generally considered to be favorable for dairying and other general farming enterprises.

The culture of the northwest Ohio milkshed area is vastly different from that of the Toledo metropolitan district. When considering the area as a whole unit, general farming, which includes livestock raising and dairying, along with the cultivation of crops, is generally considered to be the dominant rural occupation. Many people who live in this area work in the Toledo metropolitan district and carry on farming as a secondary occupation. It should be noted that minor areas within the region do not devote an equal degree of specialization to the same enterprises.

Using Toledo as a starting point when studying the utilization of the land, we find that the region is divided into distinctive land use areas or belts. Near the corporation limits of the city, especially near the western city limits, we find an area where greenhouse agriculture is im-

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

portant. Both flowers and vegetables are grown in these greenhouses almost exclusively for Toledo markets.

The next distinctive land use belt that one comes across is an area where "twilight farming" is carried on. This is a region of small farms and gardens, which generally occupy the districts where poor soil predominates. Most of the occupants of these farms work in the city and resort to farming as a secondary source of income, except when economic conditions cause unemployment in the city. Next comes the truck farming belt which is generally associated to some degree with the general farming belt. In some cases, truck farming and greenhouse agriculture operate practically in co-existent areas; that is, crops are raised under glass during the fall, winter, and spring seasons, and in the summer, truck crops are raised in outside fields that in some cases adjoin the greenhouses. The general farming belt is an area where the farms vary in size from about 40 to about 360 acres in size. The only dairying that is carried on in Lucas county is in this general farming belt.

In a belt that starts at a distance from five to twenty miles from the city and ranging from about 15 to 60 miles in width, one will find most of the dairy herds that supply most of the milk to the Toledo market. In no case does milk under normal conditions travel more than 75 or 80 miles to reach Toledo markets. During periods of short supply, milk may come from more distant sources.

Poultry raising plays an important part in the farming activities around Napoleon, Ohio. In the areas that lie south and west of Toledo, hog and beef cattle raising is important as an activity; corn is also raised in this same general area. Fruit farming is carried on around Waterville in the Maumee valley and in the eastern sections of Ottawa county that lie near Lake Erie. Tomatoes and sugar beets are raised throughout the region where better soils predominate. Sugar beet factories are located at Blissfield, Michigan and Fremont and Ottawa, Ohio. Numerous canning factories are located throughout the whole area.

Several of the small towns in the milkshed have in recent years profited by the establishment of small manufacturing enterprises. This has come about by expansion of existing small industries and by the relocation of some industrial establishments, which were formerly operated in larg-

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

er cities—like Detroit and Toledo. Labor rates are generally lower in smaller towns. This is an important factor that is causing the relocation of industries in many smaller communities.

3. *The Historical Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry*

Cattle were not indigenous to the North American continent at the time of the arrival of the first European. It was not until the last half of the seventeenth century that the American Indian became familiar with European cattle to any great extent. The first importation of European cattle into the Western hemisphere was made in the late fifteenth century by Columbus. These cattle were of Spanish extraction. In 1541, cattle were first imported into the lower St. Lawrence region by Jacques Cartier on his third voyage, but the first permanent importation of cattle into this region was made by Champlain early in the seventeenth century. By 1629, Champlain had a herd of about 60 or 70 French horned cattle in the area near Quebec. Further importations were made in 1660-1665 by Colbert when he sent some of the best dairy cows of Normandy and Brittany to Canada. The French Canadian breed, now a registered pure breed is descended from this importation. The cattle that were first imported into the Detroit region were descendants of these early importations of French cattle into Canada.⁷ Early cattle in the eastern sections of the milkshed were of Dutch and English origin. The first cattle to be imported into the United States was in 1609 into Virginia by the English. Further importations were made between 1610 and 1620 and by 1639 there were some 30,000 cattle in Virginia. Virginia can indeed be called the mother state of the American dairy industry. New England derived her early stock of cattle largely from importations from Virginia, which were first made in 1624. The Dutch are responsible for importing the first cattle into the New York colony.⁸ No attempt was made at this time to develop standardized breeds or to keep the imported breeds pure. A natural result was the development of the famous "native breed" which was a mixed or scrub breed of cattle. The "native breed" developed into the largest breed in numbers and continued to dominate the dairy breeds in the present Toledo milkshed area until the late nineteenth century.

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

The first cattle to be brought into the western Lake Erie region were imported by Cadillac, the founder of Detroit, who in 1701 took a few young calves to that post.⁹ These young calves served as the foundation for early dairy herds that developed in the Detroit region. In 1704 Cadillacs stock had multiplied to a herd of 31 of the best blooded French horned cattle.¹⁰ The animals were placed on Belle Isle to prevent depredations by the Indians.¹¹ The development of dairying during this early period was purely on a subsistence basis, with fur trapping and trading as the primary occupations. Fuller in his book *Historic Michigan* mentions that the early settlers at Detroit had large wells in which pails of butter and cream were stored for refrigeration purposes.¹² Dairying during this pioneer period was purely a seasonal occupation. During the winter the cattle had to shift for themselves since no attempt was made to store hay for winter feeding; with an increase in forage in the spring and summer dairying was resumed.

The River Raisin valley was the first area outside of the immediate Detroit area that was opened for settlement. Frenchtown, now a part of Monroe, Michigan, was first opened for settlement in 1780, when Francis Navarre received a land grant in this area from the Pottawatomie Indians. The first French settlers in the River Raisin valley were the direct descendants of the old French pioneers of Detroit.¹³ No records have been located which tell where the Frenchtown settlers obtained their cattle, but it is presumed that they obtained them from the Detroit area. The majority of the population of Michigan continued to be French until 1818 when a portion of the public lands were thrown open to settlement.¹⁴ The British, who controlled the Michigan area of the milkshed, from 1763 to 1812, did not import any English cattle into this area. Some of the Christian Indians of the Ohio area did have cattle of Dutch origin, which they obtained from Moravian missionaries as early as the 1770's.¹⁵ Early white settlement started in the Maumee valley in the late eighteenth century. When the early pioneers first began to settle in the Maumee valley, they usually brought a few cattle with them from the eastern areas of the United States. Early settlers in this region usually came from the New England states and the New York-Pennsylvania region. Cattle that generally came from this region were of the "native" type, being of English or Dutch bloodstock.

Robert Leslie Jones in his article on "The Dairy Industry in Ohio

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

Prior to the Civil War." states that by the early 1770's most of the Ohio-Indians had cattle. The Wyandot tribe which resided in the Toledo milkshed area, had obtained cattle by the time of the French and Indian War (1755-1763). The Indians obtained their cattle from the Detroit area and the frontier settlements in Virginia and Pennsylvania; usually by raiding frontier posts or by gift from missionaries or fur traders. In 1772, Moravian missionaries brought cattle to the Christian Delaware Indians in eastern Ohio. These cattle, numbering 71, were of the distinctive Dutch breed which were introduced into New York. By 1781, when the Indians moved to upper Sandusky in Wyandot county, they had about 100 cattle, mostly milk cows.

The Indians kept milk cows because they liked milk and butter. Like the early white settlers, the Indians let the cattle range through the woods, in the winter where there was only limited grass.¹⁶ The production of milk was usually restricted to the spring and summer seasons only.

The development of dairying during the period between the War of 1812 and the American Civil War, was one of development and expansion of early pioneer dairying. Dairying still remained largely on a subsistence basis, except in the Western Reserve region where a farm-type cheese industry was developing. Cattle during this period were raised for dual purposes, being raised both for beef and dairy products. As settlement progressed in the Lake Erie region, more cattle were brought into this region from outside sources to improve and increase the size of the local herds. By the early 1850's, there were about 100,000 cattle in the Ohio section of the present Toledo milkshed, but less than half were producing milk cows. Little improvement in the quality of the dominant native breed was made until the decade before the Civil War. The eastern sections of the present milkshed region showed a preference for raising cattle. The Black Swamp and western areas of the Maumee valley were opened at a later period so naturally cattle raising was not developed extensively in this region. Butter and cheese production in this period was strictly a home industry. However, it was sufficiently developed to be produced in large enough quantities to be exported, especially butter. As an example, butter was exported from Fulton county at the rate of 60,000 pounds a year.¹⁷

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

Some Devonshire and Durham (shorthorn) breeds were sometimes crossed with the local native breeds, but this was rare until the late 1850's. Animals of the Durham breed were first imported into Defiance county in 1851 for herd improvement purposes.¹⁸ By 1855 Herefords, Durhams and Devons had made their appearance in Sandusky county and were reported to have made some improvement in the herds of that county.¹⁹ The cattle herds of Michigan were in about the same state as those in Ohio. Cattlemen in northwestern Ohio seemed to favor the raising of cattle for beef purposes, while those of northeastern Ohio favored the raising of cattle for dairying purposes. Most of the residents of Toledo, about this same time, kept their own cows or obtained their milk supply from nearby farms.

Shortly after the Civil War dairying began to develop as a recognized industry in northwestern Ohio and southeastern Michigan. It was in this same period following the Civil War that major improvements were first made in farm dairy herds. About the middle 1880's the present modern dairy breeds had been introduced into this area; that is, by this time the Ayrshire, Guernsey, Holstein and Jersey breeds had been imported to improve local herds. It was also in this period following the Civil War that butter and cheese were first manufactured in creameries and factories instead of on the individual farms. Farmers in the areas near Toledo began to give more attention to dairying as the fluid milk market began to develop in the city.

The first cheese factory in Ohio was opened in 1862 and by 1866 the manufacture of cheese by the factory method had spread to Huron County, which is now in the eastern section of the present Toledo milkshed.²⁰ Prior to the Civil War some cheese was made in the Maumee valley region, but this was not large enough to meet the demand. The first dairying that was carried on for exclusive use in cheese making was commenced in 1852, in Michigan, by Samuel Horton, who came to Lenawee County from Herkimer County, New York—the cradle center of the American cheese industry. In 1853, Mr. Horton was the first man in Michigan to manufacture a desirable, edible cheese that was acceptable for the general market. He met with special success at once and the demand increased so that in 1866, he erected one of the first two cheese factories in Michigan. The first cheese factory to be placed in operation was constructed by Rufus Baker in Lenawee County. He also came

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

from New York state. After the opening of these two cheese factories, others were opened in Lenawee County, and the industry eventually spread into the northern sections of Fulton County, Ohio by the middle 1870's.²¹ It is indicated in the 1870 census report that there were fifteen cheese factories operating in Lenawee County and two in Hillsdale County, Michigan.²² In the Ohio section of the present milkshed, there were in operation in 1870 two cheese factories each in Fulton and Huron counties.²³

In 1892 creameries were operating in Fairfield, Adrian, Clinton, Clayton, Hudson, Ogden Center, and Tecumseh, Michigan.²⁴ Creameries were being operated throughout the Ohio section of the milkshed about this same time. A creamery is a factory that produces butter or butter and cheese.

In the Toledo area, the marketing of fluid milk in that city was becoming more important. Numerous producer-distributor dairymen were selling milk in Toledo from their farms which were located in the rural areas adjoining the city. Later many of these producer-distributors expanded their businesses and set up dairies in the city of Toledo. Several dairies were operated in the city during the last decade of the nineteenth century; these dairies had their milk cows in the city and feed was imported into the city from the neighboring rural areas.²⁵ George Scheuller, a delicatessen operator, was engaged in the manufacture of ice cream as a side line in 1875.²⁶ After 1890, the expansion of factory production of butter, cheese, evaporated milk (1904) and later a greater expanded fluid milk market greatly encouraged better dairy breeding and feeding practices, which in turn increased production.

The development of the modern dairy system during the first half of the twentieth century was limited largely to the introduction of milk evaporating plants and to the development of urban dairies that specialized in milk distribution and processing. Some technological improvements were made in the manufacture of butter and cheese. This period has been characterized by a series of urban dairy consolidation and affiliation with national dairy industrial organizations. The improvement in the means of transportation has favored the consolidation practice to a considerable extent. During this period the small township cheese factory gave way to large consolidated creameries and evaporated milk

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

plants. With better transportation means available, the cities were able to expand their individual milksheds, thus creating a very complex pattern of overlapping milksheds.

A near revolution was started in the dairying industry of northwestern Ohio, when in January of 1904, the Helvetia Milk Condensing Company started the operation of its plant at Delta, Ohio. Various township cheese factories found it increasingly unprofitable to operate in competition with the condensery for local milk supplies, and the disappearance of these cheese factories began in earnest. Immediately following the coming of the Helvetia Company to Fulton County, there was a new impetus added to local dairying activities. Purebred Holstein cattle were imported into the county to start new dairy herds.²⁷ In 1905(?), the Van Camp Packing Company established its plant at Wauseon, Ohio. This same company later established a plant at Adrian, Michigan. In 1924 the name of "Helvetia" was changed to the Pet Milk Company. The Pet Milk Company also operates plants at Bryan, Ohio and Hudson, Michigan. The Pet Company also operates milk receiving stations for its Delta plant at Fremont and Holgate, Ohio. In 1944, the Van Camp Packing Company discontinued its operation at Wauseon, Ohio and Adrian, Michigan, and they were taken over by the Pet Milk Company. In 1949, the Pet organization closed its plant at Wauseon and consolidated its operations at the Delta plant. In 1944 the Adrian plant was sold to the Ira Wilson Dairy, a Detroit organization. The Defiance Milk Products Company operates an evaporated milk plant at Defiance, Ohio. The Miller Gold Seal Company makes some evaporated milk at its Bowling Green plant. The Sunshine Biscuit Inc., operates an American cheese plant at Fremont, Ohio; this is the only plant that operates exclusively as a cheese plant in the present Toledo milkshed.

The Pet plant at Delta receives its milk from about 4,000 suppliers, who ship their milk daily to this plant. The Bryan and Delta plants manufacture evaporated milk exclusively, while the Hudson, Michigan plant produces "ice cream mix" in addition to evaporated milk. Several Toledo ice cream manufacturers obtain their milk supplies from this plant. Evaporated milk from these condenseries is marketed throughout the eastern United States.

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

During the early twentieth century, many creameries and butter factories were set up in the area under study, but these operations are run in connection with other milk processing operations. Although no butter is manufactured in Toledo dairies at present, some butter is manufactured in creameries located in the nearby towns of Napoleon, Adrian, and Fostoria which is known to be marketed in Toledo. A sizeable portion of the Toledo market butter comes from Iowa, Minnesota, and Wisconsin area.

During the period following the early 1900's, many local dairies or milk distribution and processing plants were set up in the various towns and cities that are located within the present Toledo milkshed to supply urban markets with fluid milk. With increased competition and increasing urban market demands, many of the remaining cheese factories found it necessary to cease operation entirely. At present owing to increased competition from urban dairies, many of the condenseries find it necessary to restrict operations during the winter months when milk is in short supply. During the flush periods of the spring and early summer, many urban dairies sell their surplus milk to the condenseries. It must be understood that the size of the Toledo milkshed is governed by the market demand for milk during the season of highest demand which is in the fall of the year.

It was also during this period that many of the farm producer-distributor dairies ceased operations. This was caused in part by the increased competition from large urban dairies which have lower unit production costs, and in part by rigid sanitary regulations established by many health departments and boards. Milk was required to be sold in bottles in Toledo in 1919. Milk first began to be marketed in bottles shortly before the first World War in the Toledo market. Recently the law has been amended to permit the sale of milk in single service containers.

4. The Modern Dairy Industry

The milk supply of Toledo comes from two states, Michigan and Ohio. About 40 per cent is produced by the farmer and the remaining 60 percent is produced by the latter. Lenawee County is the largest sup-

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

plier of milk, producing about 23 percent of the total market supply. Fulton County, which lies south of Lenawee County, produces about twenty percent of the total milk supply. Monroe County, which adjoins the eastern sector of Lenawee County, produces about fourteen percent of the total milk supply. These three counties form a region, which lies north and west of Toledo, producing about 57 percent of the total milk supply. Wood County produces eleven percent, Sandusky County produces about ten percent, and Ottawa County produces another five percent of the total milk supply. These three counties produce together 26 percent of the total fluid milk supply. These six counties are our major source of milk for the Toledo milk market. The remaining seventeen percent of the total milk supply is produced by the following counties: Seneca, Hillsdale, Williams, Lucas, Henry, Putnam, Washtenaw, Defiance, Huron, Wyandot, Jackson, Hancock, and Wayne.²⁸ The thirteen counties, which are given in their order of importance, make up the minor areas of production.

"The term Toledo, Ohio marketing area . . . means the territory within the corporate limits of the city of Toledo, and towns, and villages of Ottawa Hills, Maumee, Sylvania, Harbor View, Rossford and Trilby in Lucas County; also the townships of Monclova, Springfield, Adams, Sylvania, Washington, Jerusalem, and Oregon in Lucas County, and the townships of Perrysburg, Ross and Lake in Wood County all in the State of Ohio; the village of Lakeside and the territory with the townships of Whiteford, Bedford and Erie in Monroe County, in the State of Michigan."²⁹

Following will be a survey of the individual dairies and ice cream manufacturers who operate factories or establishments in Toledo. All the information appearing in these surveys was obtained by personal interviews with various officials of the respective businesses.

The Ohio Cloverleaf Dairy Company, Driggs Dairy Farms Inc., Babcock Dairy Company and the Page Dairy Company Inc., control over eighty percent of the dairy business in the Toledo area. They are sometimes known as the big four in the dairy business.

The Ohio Cloverleaf Dairy Company is generally conceded to be the largest dairy in the city of Toledo, and it is estimated that this dairy con-

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

trols about one-fourth of total Toledo dairy sales. This dairy was first formed in the early 1900's as the Ohio Dairy. The Ohio Dairy was one of the first Toledo dairies to sell milk in a bottled form. Previous to this, milk was sold to consumers from large metal cans which each milk wagon carried. The milk was placed in the consumers container by the milkman who distributed the milk on a door-to-door basis. With the coming of bottles, the milk was processed and bottled under more sanitary methods than under the farmer method. In 1915(?) the company merged with the Toledo Dairy. This merged dairy then took over the National Dairy in 1916(?). The Ohio Dairy took over the Cloverleaf Dairy in 1919 and became known as the Ohio Cloverleaf Dairy Company. In the early 1920's this dairy took over the Snell, Whitmore, and Cable dairies; all of these were small producer-distributor operations. In 1932, Ohio Cloverleaf became associated with the National Dairy Products corporation, which markets its products under the "Sealtest" trade name. Ohio Cloverleaf receives its milk from about 600 producers who are located in Ohio and Michigan areas of the Toledo milkshed. This dairy is the only Toledo dairy that utilizes horse drawn vehicles in its home delivery operations. The company uses thirty horse drawn vehicles and thirty trucks in its retail delivery operations. Twenty-one wholesale trucks are also used in its operations. The Ohio Toledo Ice Cream Company is associated with Ohio Cloverleaf, but its operations are carried on in another plant. Ohio Cloverleaf maintains a distribution station at Monroe, Michigan. This company utilizes the services of about 250 employees in its Toledo operations.

The Driggs Dairy Farms Inc., is an unusual dairy in that it is one of the few Toledo dairies that has not undergone any consolidations with other companies. This company started its operations at Palmyra, Michigan, where it now maintains a dairy farm, in 1915. At first the Driggs organization sold its certified milk in Toledo through the Ohio Cloverleaf Dairy, but in 1930 Driggs started selling its own milk in Toledo. In 1933 the Driggs company built its present plant in Toledo. Ice cream is also made at the Toledo plant in addition to the usual milk products. The corporation operates 87 retail and wholesale trucks including one tank truck which is used to transport milk between Toledo and Palmyra. In addition to its own milk supply, Driggs also receives milk from about 350 Ohio and Michigan dairy farms. About 225 persons are employed in the

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

total Driggs operation. Basically, the structure of the company is that of a closed corporation.

The Page Dairy Company was formed in Toledo by Henry A. Page in 1913. Previous to this date Mr. Page served as the manager of the Ohio Dairy Company. When the Toledo plant was opened in 1914, the company at first confined its operations to the manufacture of butter; and in 1919 and 1923 the production at this plant was doubled. Additional plants were opened at Whitehouse, Ohio in 1917; at Bluffton, Ohio in 1919; at Mansfield, Ohio in 1921; and Weston, Michigan in 1922; at Findlay, Ohio in 1929; at Bellefontaine, Ohio in 1942; and at Angola, Indiana in 1944. The Page Dairy is the only local dairy that is capable of using its own surplus fluid milk within its own operations. At present the Page Dairy is selling fresh cream to numerous Atlantic coastal city dairies. In addition to bottling milk, the Toledo plant manufactures ice cream and powdered milk. The powdered milk is used for animal feed. The Bluffton plant manufactures nonfat dry milk solids which are used in the baking industry to a large extent. The Bellefontaine plant serves as a distribution and receiving station, and the Findlay plant also serves the same purpose. The Mansfield plant manufactures butter in addition to its serving as a distribution plant. The Angola plant serves as a receiving station at present. The Whitehouse plant uses class III milk in its operations. Class III milk is milk that is used to make manufactured milk products (butter, cheese, evaporated milk, etc.). No information was obtained on the operations of the Weston, Michigan plant. Page operates 24 retail and 29 wholesale routes out of its Toledo plant. The Toledo plant employs about 180 persons. Milk is received at this plant from about 350 producers. Page is generally considered to be one of the largest independent dairy manufacturing operations in this part of the country.

William H. Babcock first entered the dairy business as a producer-distributor in 1891. In 1908 his son, Roy W. Babcock, entered the dairy business. The processing of milk was first started in 1911; later the present dairy plant was built in West Toledo. The Hostler Dairy was taken over soon after the company began its processing operations. The Ludwig Lane and Jameson dairies were taken over in 1941 and 1943. Babcock at present operates 62 retail and eight wholesale trucks. Milk supplies are received from 330 suppliers who are located in both the

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

Michigan and the Ohio regions of the Toledo milkshed. About 190 persons are employed in the Toledo operation. A distribution station is operated at Monroe, Michigan which handles bottled milk from the Toledo plant.

The remaining dairies comprise a group of small independent organizations which when taken individually are not considered as being important in the Toledo dairy picture. As a group these dairies control not more than twenty percent of the Toledo milk market sales.

The Village Farm Dairy is the only dairy that is at present (1951) located in East Toledo. This dairy was first organized in 1922 and has expanded its operations to marketing its products on a city wide basis. This dairy also sells milk in Bowling Green, Ohio. The Lippert and Manhattan dairies were bought out in 1938 (?) and 1945 (?) respectively by the Village Farm organization. About 90 percent of this dairy's business is confined to retail home delivery operations in which 21 trucks are used. Two additional trucks are used in its wholesaling operations. Village Farm Dairy receives its milk from 105 suppliers who are all located in the Ohio section of the Toledo milkshed. At present the Borden Ice Cream Plant in Toledo is receiving its fluid milk supply from the Village Farm Dairy.

The Cherry Grove Dairy was set up as a company in 1922. This dairy, which is located in a rural farm area, first operated as a producer-distributor until about 1924 when a fire destroyed its herd of 65 dairy cows. In 1924, W. C. Scharer gave up his farming operations and limited his work to processing and distribution operations. During its existence as a dairy this company has taken over the Wilson Park, Johnson and People's dairies. The Cherry Grove Dairy at present receives its milk from about 100 farmers who are located on four milk routes; two of which are located in Monroe County, Michigan and two of which are located in Ottawa, Wood and Sandusky counties in Ohio. Cherry Grove operates 12 retail and one wholesale trucks; and in addition to this several independent operators sell milk for Cherry Grove. Thirty-two persons are employed by Cherry Grove. The dairy makes no butter or ice cream but does manufacture cottage cheese in addition to its usual fluid milk products. Fluid milk is sold to the Franklin Ice Cream Company which uses this milk to supplement its own sources. Surplus milk is at present being sold to the

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

Driggs Dairy, which is in short supply now. Cherry Grove sells its milk only in the Toledo area.

The Kroger Dairy is unique in that it is the only Toledo dairy that packs all of its milk in one way service containers. This dairy was formed during the 1920's as a part of the Kroger Grocery and Baking Company. Milk is marketed through various Kroger retail stores in the Toledo area. This dairy obtains milk from about 40 dairy farmers who are located in the Ohio section of the Toledo milkshed. Milk from this dairy is marketed in nearby Michigan and Ohio Kroger stores.

The Degner Brothers Dairy was founded in 1919 by Louis and Karl Degner. Previous to this time, their father had operated a dairy in Toledo. In 1942, Degner's bought out the Muntzer Dairy, and in 1945 bought out the Shepard Dairy. Recently, the Glendale Dairy was bought out by this same concern. At present, the Degner Dairy is a proprietorship, which is owned and operated by Karl Degner. At present this company operates one wholesale and ten retail trucks. This dairy receives its milk mostly from Michigan, but some is received from Ohio areas. At present milk is received from about 40 suppliers. This dairy does not sell milk to other Toledo dairies, but it does sell its surplus milk to a Delta, Ohio condensery. Cottage cheese is the only other product made by this dairy other than the usual fluid milk products. About 25 persons are employed in the operation of this dairy.

The Trilby Farm Dairy Inc., was established in 1929 by John Cowell. The company changed hands in 1947 and was later incorporated in 1948. The corporation operates one wholesale and seven retail trucks. The company employs fifteen persons in its dairy operations. Only about twenty percent of its milk is sold within the corporation limits of Toledo. However, most of the milk is sold in the metropolitan areas which adjoin the western Toledo city limits. This dairy receives its milk from 27 Ohio and Michigan milk producers. This dairy is at present selling milk to the Kroger Dairy and cream to a creamery in Napoleon, Ohio.

The Jersey Farm Dairy is a small cash and carry dairy, which is located in Trilby, Ohio. Milk is obtained for this dairy from Michigan Milk Producers Co-operative in Adrian, Michigan, where the milk is pasteurized. The milk is bottled in Trilby and sold to retail customers at the dairy only. Little, if any, milk from this dairy enters Toledo.

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

There are four ice cream manufacturers of major importance who operate plants in Toledo. These plants manufacture ice cream as their major occupation and do not handle or process other dairy products. The Dairy Queen organization operates several stores in the Toledo area, but they obtain their ice cream mix from outside of the Toledo milkshed area. The Dairy Queen product can not be legally called ice cream because it does not meet the ten percent state butterfat requirement for ice cream.

The Franklin Ice Cream Company is the largest independent ice cream manufacturing operation in Toledo excluding those which are operated in connection with other dairies. This company was organized in 1921 and a branch was opened in Cleveland in 1934. In 1940 this company built its new Monroe Street plant. Ice cream from the Toledo plant is marketed through eleven retail stores and through a dairy store at the Babcock Dairy plant. This company employs about 100 to 150 persons depending upon the season of the year. Franklin makes its own ice cream mix from "40 % cream," which it obtains from the Sunshine Biscuit Company cheese factory at Fremont, Ohio, and from milk received from the Cherry Grove Dairy. One farm is operated by this company which furnishes a small supply of milk.

In 1946 the Goon Ice Cream Company, which was organized in 1936, was taken over by the Borden organization. The former company had expanded its operations in 1945 by building a new plant. All the ice cream manufactured by Borden's is sold wholesale to various retail outlets for resale. Some milk is obtained from the Village Farm Dairy in Toledo, but cream is obtained from Springfield and Fort Recovery, Ohio and from various sources in Wisconsin. Ice cream from this plant is marketed in nearby Michigan cities besides being marketed in Toledo.

The Vronman-Schaver Company was set up in 1936 by Mr. Schaver, and in 1948 the business was sold to the Vronman Brothers who now operate the business. In 1950, the organization was incorporated. Milk supplies (ice cream mix) are obtained from the Pet Milk Company plant at Hudson, Michigan. About 200,000 gallons of ice cream are produced annually with about 60% being marketed in quart packages. The ice cream is sold on a cash and carry basis to retail outlets. The company employs from two to ten persons depending upon the market demands for its products.

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

There are a few farmers around the Toledo area who sell raw milk to customers who patronize their farm dairies. However, a recent attempt has been made to require the pasteurization of all milk which is sold for human consumption. This move will eliminate these producer-distributors who can not operate profitably under the new regulation.

There are numerous dairies located in the Toledo milkshed area, but no detailed survey of these dairies has been made, because they do not sell their products to any great extent in the Toledo market. They are not a part of the milkshed because they do not sell the products in the Toledo market. The milk evaporating plants that are located within the milkshed do influence the prices paid for milk by Toledo dairies to a considerable extent, since these operations are the largest consumers of milk within the area of the Toledo milkshed.

Milk is generally transported to Toledo markets entirely by means of motor trucks. The farmer generally places his milk in ten gallon cans which are picked up by trucks operating throughout the rural milkshed area. The average milk collection truck can haul from about 100 to 200 ten gallon cans of milk. These trucks are not generally operated by the dairies but are contracted out to various individuals. The farmer generally pays these contract haulers thirty-five cents per hundred pounds of milk for transporting his milk to the city dairies.

The dairies use two types of trucks to transport their milk depending upon the type of sale under which the milk has been sold. Small trucks are used for retail home delivery purposes and larger trucks are used for their wholesale trade. A few tank trucks are used to handle surplus fluid milk to the milk evaporating plants.

As a result of this survey, several trends have become apparent in the dairy and dairying industries. In the dairy industry, there seems to be a distinct trend toward fewer dairies, while the larger dairies are becoming affiliated with nationwide organizations. The larger dairies tend to buy out smaller dairies largely for the purpose of obtaining more retail home delivery routes and thus expanding their business.

There is another trend in the milk producer areas which supply milk to the Toledo market. The major areas of milk supply seem to be shift-

*A Survey of the Development of Dairying and the Dairy Industry
in the Toledo Milkshed Area*

ing from the areas that are south and east of Toledo to those areas which are west and north of Toledo. This is possibly being caused by increased competition from the Cleveland fluid milk markets.

FOOTNOTES

1. U.S. Department of Agriculture . . . "Analysis of Producer Receipts . . . Toledo . . . Milk Marketing Area," for the year 1950.
2. Dunbar, Carl, *Historical Geology*, New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1949, p. 451.
3. Lackey and Anderson, *Regions and Nations of the World*, (New York: D. Van Nostrand Company, Inc., 1946), p. 52.
4. U.S. Department of Agriculture, *Soil Survey of Lucas County Ohio*, G. W. Correy and others, p. 5.
5. Ohio Agricultural Experiment Station, *Bulletin No. 608*, pp. 18-19.
6. U.S. Department of Agriculture, *Soil Survey of Lucas County Ohio*, *op. cit.*, p. 5.
7. Ruddick, J. A., . . . *The Dairy Industry in Canada*, Toronto, 1937, pp. 15-16.
8. "First Cattle in America," in *Hoards Dairyman*, vol. 72, pp. 188-9, (February 25, 1927).
9. Ruddick, *op. cit.*, p. 16.
10. Laut, A. C., "*Cadillac*," . . . p. 150.
11. Fuller, "Historic Michigan," p. 171.
12. *Ibid.*, p. 171.
13. Wing, "History of Monroe County Michigan," pp. 37-43.
14. *Ibid.*, p. 131.
15. Jones, in *Ohio State Archaeological and Historical Quarterly*, vol. LVI p. 46, (1947).
16. *Ibid.*, pp. 46-47.
17. *Ohio Agricultural Report*, 1850, p. 488.
18. *Ohio Agricultural Report*, 1851, p. 248.
19. *Ohio Agricultural Report*, 1855, p. 203.
20. *Ohio Agricultural Report*, 1866, p. 168.
21. Bonner, *Memoirs of Lenawee County Michigan*, vol. I, pp. 268-70.
22. 1870 *Census Report of the United States*, vol. III, pp. 680-81.
23. *Ibid.*, pp. 714-15.
24. Cadwell, *Atlas of Lenawee County Michigan*, pp. 16-33.
25. Durant, *Historical Atlas of Lucas County*, pp. 23-35.
26. *Ibid.*, p. 39.
27. *The Delta Atlas*, vol. 34, No. 43, February 27, 1919. (Special farm issue).
28. U.S. Department of Agriculture, *Producer Receipt*, *op. cit.*
29. U.S.D.A., Agriculture Marketing Administration, Order 30 as amended effective June 23, 1942, p. 2. Rossford is located in Wood County, not in Lucas County.

Democratic Jollification in Attica, 1884

BY HARRY S. BLAINE

The Cleveland-Blaine political campaign of 1884 had ended. The oratory, the charges and counter-charges, the backbiting, had died down as election day approached. On the evening of November 4th tensely the country awaited the verdict of the voters which was to determine if the party that had been in the saddle since the Civil War was to continue, or whether it was at last to be displaced from power. Let us here deviate a little to examine a factor that entered this campaign which was to become a classic.

Grover Cleveland, the Democratic candidate, had had some unsavory details of his past private life exposed to the merciless gaze of the political opposition. James G. Blaine, his opponent, the popular "Man from Maine," had not come through the campaign unscathed. Stories were told of shady deals in railroad stocks involving him; the "Mulligan" letters were cited to discredit him and finally, in the closing days of the campaign, the Democrats seized upon a circumstance that was to prove decisive and land their candidate in the White House. We refer to the unfortunate (for the Republicans) remarks of one Rev. Birchard in a meeting in New York City where had gathered a group of ministers to welcome Blaine to the city.

The speaker regularly assigned to make the welcoming speech was detained and Birchard, a standby substitute, was assigned in his place. During his remarks he used the words: "Rum, Romanism and Rebellion" in describing the opposition party. Having apparently let his bigotry run away with his better judgment, he knocked the props from under his candidate's chances for success at the polls. The second of Birchard's trio of epithets used on this occasion, of course, had reference to the Catholic church. This unfortunate injection of the religious angle into the campaign near its close alienated the Irish voters of New York City, who resented any slighting reference to their church. Altho previously favorable to Blaine, after the Birchard incident they turned against him and his party. Thus was lost to the Republicans the New York City vote, the New York State electoral vote and the election—all because of the ill-advised utterance of one word! The irony of it all was, that

Blaine's own mother was of the Catholic faith; thus by what stretch of the imagination could anyone believe that the son would ever do anything to discredit his mother's religion?

In 1884 the village of Attica, Ohio, was a typical midwestern town of about 800 inhabitants. It was at the crossing place of the old Sandusky Pike and the Tiffin-New Haven and east-and-west road. Just a mile north, at Siam, was the line of the Baltimore & Ohio Railroad. There were no telephones save a crude instrument in Lester Sutton's bank, licensed from the Bell Telephone Company which recently had come into ownership of telephone patents. This line was used to communicate with the railway depot in Siam. The Postal Telegraph & Cable Company had a heavy pole line following the Tiffin road into Attica, where it took to the alley back of Heabler's grist mill and so on through town to its eastern corporation where it again joined the Tiffin road. The company had an office with operator in the second story of a building on North Main Street adjacent to the line. A local wire served the needs of the town. The operator in 1884 was C. C. Vanasdal. At election time it was customary for citizens interested to chip into a fund to pay the telegraph operator to take off the news wire details of the voting, which were given to the waiting audience and then relayed to the town.

Our scene now shifts to two "Poor men's Clubs," vulgarly called saloons, in this election year in Attica. Joe Kipe Myers' place was on East Tiffin Street near the square and a little way 'round the corner on South Main was the establishment of A. Kappus. On this election night there was high revel, culminating in great excitement, in these two places when runners from the telegraph office brought the astounding news of the probable election of Cleveland to the Presidency. Nobody thought he had a chance against the peerless "Man from Maine." Pandemonium broke loose and there was many an argument of disbelief, of jubilation and of chagrin among the celebrants that night. Among those in Kipe's place was a printer who had come from Pittsburgh the past summer, William Irvine Blaine, father of young Dr. Harry G. Blaine who had but recently come from Reedtown and established himself in Attica. Having had opportunity in 1884 to buy out the Attica *Journal* office and being himself a printer, he had persuaded his parent to come out to Ohio to assist with the work of publication. The elder Blaine was a veteran of the late war, a red hot Republican, always willing to "argufy" loud and long with anyone who would listen, about the virtues of his

party and its candidate. As the dire news of the defeat of his champion came in over the wire that night, disbelief at first had gradually given way to reluctant certainty. In such circumstances, what other surcease, with the means ready to hand, but liberal potations from the "flowing bowl"?

In Attica at that time as in other towns, interest in this hotly contested election ran high. Most folk conceded that Cleveland had but small chance and that it looked like the usual Republican victory, as had been the case ever since the Civil War. When the fact that the Democrats had indeed won had finally sunk into the minds of the faithful, in the first burst of enthusiasm it was decreed that there should be a suitable celebration. Shortly there gathered together a group of local victors to plan a fiesta that would open the eyes of the villagers that fall. And so it came about that on the Saturday night following the election, Attica was the scene of a "Jollification" which, insofar as we know, was its first and last one.

Among the earliest of the memories of the writer is his participation, at the age of $4\frac{1}{2}$ years, in this Jollification of 1884 as the bearer of kerosene, or "coal oil" torch in the parade. He with his brother Earl and around 20 other small boys of the town were given torches to carry. These were made in Strandler's tinshop by the tinner, Billy Mundwiler, and were nothing more than a small tin can with top opening for a wick and a short tube at the bottom into which to slip the carrying stick. The parade as we recall, started in front of the Dr. Myers residence on North Main Street, and, led by the village band, proceeded south to the square and beyond as far as John Lebold's house, then turned back to the square and headed east on Tiffin Street as far as the Mundwiler home which was right next to Sam Hawk's pasture field. Again turning, the parade went west as far as the mill, then completed its march to the square. As far as the writer's memory serves, it appears that the order of the procession was: first the band, then local Democrats, then the torch bearers, followed by a numerous company of anyone who wanted to march. Of the members of the band, the only one we can distinctly recall is Joe Todd, the town marshal, who tooted the bass horn. He was the father of Alf Todd, a boyhood playmate, who lived with his parents in the Dr. Jones home.

Democratic Jollification in Attica, 1884

The celebration wound up with a giant bonfire in the middle of the town square. Men and boys scoured the business district for loose store-boxes and empty barrels, all ruthlessly consigned to the flames that night to celebrate the great victory. Meanwhile the band played through its repertoire of tunes. As the flames died down around midnight, the celebrants gradually dispersed to their homes. But sad to relate, we fear that many tarried, and too long, at the taverns of Joe Kipe and his confrere, A. Kappus.

The writer's memory, too immature then to record the names of the band members, has been reinforced by the recollections of Clint Pitcher, himself the leader of later bands and orchestras for many years and still a resident of Attica. He states that the following were members of the Attica Band organized about 1883:

Tom Gray	George Engelhart	Jesse Buckingham
Bert Tompkins	Jake Engelhart	Louis Youngs
John Engelhart	Joe Todd	Cal Ring

But what of the disconsolate printer from Pittsburgh whom we left in Kipe's saloon, brooding over the defeat of his champion and kinsman? Sorrowfully, in the early hours of "the morning after" he found his way home, an embittered but wiser man. For several days thereafter he was not much good at setting type in the *Journal* office. He was floored by the harsh logic of facts. After a few days, true to the traditions of the tramp printer, he turned his face again to other, as he thought, greener fields just beyond the view. He returned to Pittsburgh leaving his son, Harry, to struggle alone with his country newspaper until a young man by the name of George Clifford Lake, a native of the town, came to the rescue and was employed to act as editor and manager. Thus was Cliff Lake launched on his newspaper career in Attica, which he followed all the rest of his life.

Midwestern: Grandma Vance

1810-1901

BY ALFRED VANCE CHURCHILL

Grandma Vance was like mother. It was altogether fitting that these two Henrietta's should bear the same name, for while they differed widely in temperament and personal flavor they were in many ways so exactly alike that the same words would describe them. Grandmother was quieter, more tranquil in spirit, less exuberant. She, too, worked hard. She was continually occupied with useful toil; but she was not forever constrained by some inward urge to work beyond her strength. So she kept, throughout her long life, a fine nervous poise that her daughter in more favorable circumstances might perhaps have achieved.

For her husband, grandma was the one and perfect mate. Their affection and consideration for each other was touching. Their confidence in each other was infinite. They were unlike in personality and gifts but in thought and feeling they were harmonious to an extraordinary degree. Their blood-strain must also have been quite similar, though in grandma's case the Scottish blood was predominant.

Grandmother was a daughter of the Reverend Stephen Thompson, the gentleman who refused to give up his "ungodly great fiddle" to please a committee of his deacons, as recorded in my Prologue. Grandma came of a long line of preachers. She told us that her generation was the first they knew of—there being no son in the family—which had not brought forth a minister. It was one of the fondest wishes of her heart to "give a son to the Lord," but her only man-child had died in infancy. Thus ended a dynasty of preachers that went back to the Covenanters.

Great-grandfather Thompson was a blue-blooded Presbyterian of the classic type, who sometimes preached the Word in broad Scots. We have an excellent daguerreotype that shows his honest, kind, care-worn features. No doubt he thought nearly everybody on earth was bound

Copyright, 1955, by Marie M. Churchill

for destruction. It is a strong face. It had to be. He looks as if he bore the burden of the world on his shoulders. We are told that he was revered and loved by the people of his parish and the members of his household.

Of great-grandmother Thompson I know only that her maiden name was Henrietta Beach. I remember that grandmother spoke of her with honor and affection. She was the mother of four daughters,—Gloriana, Henrietta (Grandma Vance), Sarah, and one I never saw whose name I have forgotten. The girls were strongly individual in character. Sarah was grandma's "baby sister" whom she cared for and taught to read. Sarah was too soft, too innocent and confiding for practical life. Gloriana, the oldest and the handsomest of the sisters, was tall, proud, capable, selfish and vain. She was continually sought in marriage, but had no use for men and died a virgin. The third sister faded away in the bloom of youth. There was something mysterious and lovely about her. Her acquaintances looked upon her as almost a saint. She seemed a stranger in this world and they were not surprised when she left earth for Heaven. Her brief story made a deep impression on us because it was the only thing of the kind we had ever heard of.

Until this break in the family circle, the four grew up side by side and were carefully nurtured and educated according to the standards of the early nineteenth century. Grandmother taught school when she was sixteen. People said that the beauty of the family went to Gloriana. But I knew them all except the saint and have seen daguerrotypes taken when they were perhaps thirty years old; and in my opinion Henrietta stood above her sisters in character and distinction if not in actual beauty. That old saying about beauty being "only skin deep" is really great nonsense. Beauty begins with the bones. Grandma Vance's bones were small and well-proportioned. I remember the fine articulation of her shoulders and back and her lovely neck, straight as an arrow, but gracious and flexible. It is a delight to me when I see that neck reappearing on the fair dimpled bodies of children in the fourth generation after her.

As to her character and disposition Grandma Vance was the most perfect woman I ever knew and one of the most lovable. It has been said that saints are hard to live with. Grandma had no fault that was visible to the naked eye, yet I have never known anyone I would rather have in the house. She was like mother in her unselfishness and tender con-

science; her life was spent in the service of others. Like mother she was strong and sweet and good; but she was better poised and had better judgment. Unlearned in the wisdom of the Greeks, she instinctively followed the warning, "Never too much."

It was not altogether easy to live with mother, much as we loved her. You felt her eye upon you. You felt that she was praying for you and that she would like to be assured—every moment—that you were doing your duty. There was no such uneasiness with regard to grandma. She was very careful, too, about interfering with the lives of others.

I have a letter from her, of July 1894, in which she speaks of Carroll, then about to enter the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. "I wish to ask you *in confidence* if you know of any way to help him out of his *absent-mindedness*. He is a dear boy—but this is a fault which will bring him great trouble all his life both in business and family affairs. For instance, I cannot trust him to bring us anything home from Market—he will come home at noon without the meat or bread which he must have for his dinner. I hope it is not wrong for me to speak of it."

Grandmother, too, was brought up on the older Presbyterian creed, the doctrines of which were far less liberal than those we were familiar with at Oberlin. She knew the Shorter Catechism from "Man's chief end is to glorify God and to enjoy him forever" to the very last sentence, and for spiritual value held it next to the Bible itself. She tried to bribe us to learn it. There was a standing offer of ten dollars to any grandchild who would do it, but none of us ever got more than half the money. We wanted it badly enough, but that Catechism was too long and too uninteresting for *us*.

Grandma's creed was narrow, but her heart was as big as the world. How she bore that burden of hell and damnation—and how millions of others bore it—is food for thought and a problem for the psychologist. How can people live contentedly on the slope of a live volcano? How do *we* live, knowing what is going on in Europe, Africa and Asia, and not knowing how soon the same horrors may be upon us? Grandma's mind did not dwell on these things but on the love of a Heavenly Father. She had the confidence of a child in the heart of its father and her belief in the goodness and mercy of God outweighed every other theolog-

ical conception. I noted with some astonishment that, when Aunt Ann died "unsaved," grandma did not seem to be particularly worried about her fate.

Grandmother did not fail to do whatever she could to rescue the perishing. Her own wedding-ring went into the missionary box and hundreds of dollars were given by her to the training of ministers of the Gospel. Besides helping grandfather save money and "invest it in the Lord's work," Grandma had funds of her own from which she spent the interest on the charities that most appealed to her. I have one of her old account books which tells me of a "Consecrated Fund" of one thousand dollars which she had "inherited from Grandma Beach."

I must not pass on without a tribute to the great characters I have known that were produced under that narrow and dogmatic creed. Religion would seem to be a joint product of the given cult and its devotees. The finer souls disregard, instinctively and unconsciously, the parts of the tradition that are of no help to them, and draw life and light from those that do. The men and women I am writing of felt themselves close to the heart of God. They could commune with Him at any moment; and neither life nor death would harm them, for they had sure faith in a blessed immortality in his presence in the world to come—a faith that brought them such confidence and peace of mind as their children can never know.

"Puritanism in its historic form had controlled the direction of pioneering . . . When you study these long, rigid rows of dessicated men and women," says Mr. Waldo Frank (quoted by Mr. de Voto in his *Mark Twain's America*) "you feel that you are in the presence of some form of life that has hardened but not grown . . . Their jaws are rigid. Their eyes are of lead, they have so long denied the beauties of the world" . . . I do not recognize the picture. The words fail to fit my ancestors on either side of the family, nor can such terms be used in connection with the late generation of "Puritans" that I knew in my boyhood.

Mr. Frank's long rows of dessicated people fascinate and fill us with wonder. Since he could not have seen them in the flesh, he must have been thinking of existing portraits. Those we have were painted for the most part by untrained artists, who made jaws and eyes of lead because they could do no other. But aside from such, do we not find many por-

traits by nameless artists of talent, that represent fine men and lovely women?

The daguerreotypes rise before the mind. Of these it might indeed be possible to assemble "long rows" that would correspond with Mr. Frank's description. But the real Puritans had gone to their rest long before the daguerreotype appeared. When it came, the luckless sitters had to be immobilized for many minutes, with an iron prod at the back of their heads; which may account, in part, for their "Puritanical expressions." And in spite of everything hundreds of these little portraits show men and women of a physical and mental beauty refuting the thesis of the leaden eye and the rigid jaw.

The debunkers have exaggerated their case. President Timothy Dwight, of Yale, sheds a milder light on the Puritans of New England in his description of a pastoral visit. The "Smooth Divine", he tells us,—

Smoked with each goody, thought her cheese excelled.
Her pipe she lighted, and her baby held.

It is easy to get an amazingly false idea of our sires, of only three or four generations back. They were not the joyless ascetics of our novelists. The "good" people of those times were in some respects more liberal than those of today. Though much concerned with revivals of religion, they did not eschew the comforts of tobacco and alcoholic drinks. That we cannot compare their per capita consumption of wine, rum and cordials with ours is due to the fact that their drink was so largely manufactured at home; but it must have been considerable. They were less averse from pleasure than is commonly supposed. Their fondness for good food and the size of their families would seem to indicate this. They loved a joke and there are reasons to believe they loved beauty . . . In short, they were more like ourselves than we thought.

Henrietta Thompson (our "Grandmother Vance") was born in 1810, in Connecticut Farms, New Jersey, where her father held a pastorate. There she spent her youth. After completing her formal education and teaching school for a year—earning a hundred dollars—she went to New York City where she spent four months with a fashionable modiste "to learn to make better clothes." She was not yet seventeen. The year must have been 1826 and I am told that the address was 37 Bowery.

Midwestern: Grandma Vance

The women of grandma's family liked good clothes and understood dress-making. Their wardrobes were well supplied with pretty petticoats, nice under-wear and dresses of various use—all made, of course, by hand and mostly by their own hands. The girls were expert in all sorts of ornamental work,—lace-making, embroidery and fancy knitting.

At twenty-two grandma married and went with Grandpa Vance to Lima, where her children were born. It always seemed to me strange that grandfather should have taken that rather small, refined and sensitive young creature out to what was really—if not technically—the frontier.

Grandfather knew that the country was composed of rich forests and prairies with very fine soil. His wife had been used to plenty. He desired to provide a competence for the children that might be born to them; so he went into the Indiana wilderness to take up land.

Four years later great-grandfather Thompson followed the young couple with his family, established himself in a new pastorate, and there he lived with his wife and daughters—all except Grandma Vance—for the rest of their lives. There was quite a little circle of Eastern people besides,—the Howes, Corys, Upsons, Williams, and Humes—some of them old friends.

So grandma became a pioneer, little fitted as she might have seemed for such a life. She survived the experience, bore her children, kept her health and lived to the age of ninety-one. If she was a "delicate little woman," as I have heard her called by one of her intimate friends, it was not the kind of delicacy that Howells imputes to the row of semi-invalids offered us in his works as the preferred type of American womanhood.

Like her husband, Grandma Vance represented the kind of frugality without parsimony that is found in its perfection among certain people of Scottish descent. She taught us that waste was a sin and took good care of everything she had. The kerosene lamp with its balloon-shaped Sandwich glass bowl and milk-white shade stood on their table every evening for a generation, unbroken and in perfect condition. Her dishes, and the furniture that grandfather made for their new home at her marriage, were intact at her death. The kitchen-chairs I used to sit on

while I had my bowl of bread and milk—or warm gruel, if I was sick and which stand today in our living-room, are over a hundred years old and as good as ever. Some of the rush-bottoms are still intact.

There was a reserve in grandmother's speech that seems to me to be a Scottish trait, allied to frugality. How often have I heard her warning—"My, child, my child! do not exaggerate so. 'Let your yea be yea and your nay nay, for whatsoever is more than this cometh of evil.'"

Grandmother liked Scottish stories and once in a while would tell one herself, using the dialect which she spoke perfectly. A story was told in our home about a Scotsman's praise of his wife. Some one had said how beautiful the lady was. The husband was silent. "Don't you think so yourself?" asked the admirer. "She might be waur," was the answer. Grandmother's compliments and disparagements all had something of this quality. We were speaking of an incorrigible old reprobate, regretting that some of my companions had been seen in his company. "I'm afraid," said grandma, "that he will do those young boys but *little good*."

Grandma's reserve was equally marked in what I may be allowed to denominate—stretching the phrase a little—as her type of profanity. There was not much in our family speech that could have been objected to, even by the most rigid moralist, on the ground of blasphemy. Never have I heard a brother of mine take the name of God in vain. Even the Devil's name was not to be spoken lightly. Father sometimes exclaimed, "My stars!" Frank, when he was excited said "Jehoshaphat." Our favorite oaths—and about the worst—were golly, darn and gol-darn. Grandma Vance disliked them very much. "Swear not *at all*," she would gravely admonish . . . Yet it was maintained by some in private conference (we would not for the world have hurt her by speaking of it) that grandma herself had a word that she used when she was awfully cut up. Grandma's swear-word was "My, my, my!"

It must not be thought that grandma was a solemn old party, who smiled seldom and never laughed. I have said she was less exuberant than mother. But grandma Vance, when I knew her, was sixty years old; how do I know what she was at twenty? She had a keen sense of humor, was quick to smile and laughed easily though softly and with reserve. She enjoyed good stories and had nice little ones of her own. Here is a specimen which she said was a favorite in her family and which

seems to me, in some obscure way, an example of a frugal joke. It might be entitled,—“There’s mony a slip twixt cup and lip.”

Grandmother had a girl cousin, the eldest of a family of eleven, who had had a large share in taking care of her brothers and sisters. She said she had “weaned all of them except herself and was bound not to wean any more.” At a favorable age this girl was sought in marriage by a young man of good family and position, whom she liked very much; but she held him off until she reached the age of forty-one, when she accepted an engagement ring. At last she was forty-six and they were married. At forty-nine she bore him a son! . . . Grandma’s ripple of laughter at the recollection would have won your heart. At the end of the tale she would remark, in her serious way, but still faintly smiling—“He must have been a very *patient* man.”

At the age of seventy-seven grandmother lost her life-companion. She wrote in a letter a few years later,—“After laying his body to rest in our own beautiful Westwood, where he had labored so many years, arranging and beautifying the grounds, as we returned the question arose, how I was to live alone. Papa Churchill with his characteristic readiness for an answer, quoted John 19th:27 ‘And from that hour that disciple took her unto his own home’ . . . He took me into his family and has cared for my comfort as he would have done for his own mother.”

Grandma’s last great sorrow came with the death of her daughter. This unexpected bereavement completed the destruction of the family. The children were now scattered to the ends of the earth and father and grandmother were left alone. Father sold the home and the two retired to Seattle to spend their declining years—father to live with brother Fred and grandmother with sister Mary. I never saw her again and I owe my subsequent knowledge of her life to her letters, which were fairly regular, and to what Mary told me of her.

It was hard to be torn up by the roots at the age of eighty-six and separated from her old friends and associates, but she bore it patiently. She still had five years to live. There was no lack of affection between grandma and my sister, who cared for her as tenderly as mother could have done. She had a beautiful room with her own fire-place where her “grandson” built a bright fire every morning as father had done at home.

She walked her mile—conscientiously every day—on the vine-covered porch and enjoyed the color and scent of the marvellous roses, blooming even at Christmas time. If she was old and easily tired, her hands were still busy knitting stockings and mittens for the great-grandchildren in distant cities. Her hands! Those hands of her later life, worn by loving toil, were as impressive as the "praying hands" of Albrecht Dürer.

We thought of grandma as above human weakness. It seemed to us that she must always have been serene and perfect—immaculate. How hard it is for the young to conceive that such a woman may have been "tempted in all points" like as they, and not—perhaps—"without sin"! Grandma Vance in those last years gave Mary little confidences that enable us—reading between the lines—to see that she was more like ourselves than we thought. "Oh my dear," she said, "I had a hard time with myself!" What did grandma mean by that? Was she vain of her bright eyes and pretty figure? of the clothes she made so nicely and the lingerie on which she spent so much time? Was she jealous of Gloriana's superior beauty? Did she try to cut the proud sister out of her best beau? Was she sometimes even tempted to flirt?

Love of good clothes was certainly a weak point with her. Perhaps the Devil took a mean advantage of it. He had an accessory,—an unconscious accessory—even after her marriage—in grandfather, with his presents of fine dress-goods. "I had a hard time with myself." Let us fear old Satan when bringing gifts!

We have a daguerreotype that shows the perfect curve of grandma's shoulders, set off by round puffed sleeves. Mary asked her how those puffs were kept so nice and round? "With goose-down." "Wasn't it very hot, grandma, especially in summer?" "Pretty warm," said grandma. She confessed that she had once walked two miles and back to get some green taffeta silk for a poke bonnet of the kind then in fashion; carrying her baby in her arms, for she had no baby-carriage at the time.

Once more I am constrained to give my own interpretation of thoughts and deeds of those who were reared in the Puritan tradition. I must say, for the "Puritans" I knew, that they had no deficiency of the sense and the love of beauty and no doctrine which forbade enjoyment of it. On the contrary, the Bible which gave them their rule of life abounds in

readings that reveal a passion for beauty: I remember not a single phrase which speaks against it. As for the beauty of women, the scriptural expression—"fair to look upon"—is certainly not used in a derogatory sense.

Some of the Puritans liked fair women. Some of the women liked pretty dresses. There were those, not only among scholars, who had a weakness for music, sound prose and good verse. I seem to remember some of the old homes, with flower-gardens, front door-ways and fan-lights, that were not so bad. They thought they were honoring the Lord when they built those old churches of theirs, and those tall, graceful steeples which have, certainly, no utilitarian motive. Also they believed that "the Lord's Table" should be beautifully and sumptuously set. We have "ample confirmation of the Puritans' insistence on beauty in its most appropriate place." (Finney's communion table with its snowy linen, plain silver plates for the bread and plain, but perfectly designed silver tankards and goblets for the wine, was the most beautiful I have ever seen.)

No—what they feared was not beauty but pride, pride—that foe of the faithful from time immemorial! They were mindful, too, of the temptation to think too much of earthly beauty and to forget "the beauty of holiness." One might have supposed that grandma placed small value on physical perfection and that sensuous charm could have no place in her imaginings. She spoke but rarely of such matters. But little things that slipped out unconsciously, in those later months of her life, gave unexpected glimpses of what she had so sweetly concealed. When her granddaughter let her know that she was expecting a child, there came a quick little sigh and the words—"Now your breasts will never be so pretty again!"

The dear soul was now ninety-one years old and glad that her pilgrimage was nearly done. One day toward the last, my sister was comforting her by stroking her back and shoulders. "Why, grandmother," she exclaimed in delight, "you have darling little *dimples* in your shoulders!" Grandma's emotion on receiving this news was as delicate—as impalpable as a breath. "Have I?" was all she answered.

. . . A few short months and Mary was holding her arms about her while she yielded up her gentle spirit. At the end the words came low

and weak—"The Lord is my Shepherd . . ." The voice faltered and the watcher went on with the psalm to its confident close—"and I will dwell in the house of the Lord forever."